## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

STATE OF OKLAHOMA, et al., \*

\*

Plaintiffs,

\*

v. \* 05-CV-0329 GKF-PJC

\*

TYSON FOODS, INC., et al., \*

\*

Defendants. \*

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

VIDEO DEPOSITION OF JACK WALTON

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

ANSWERS AND DEPOSITION OF JACK WALTON, produced as a witness at the instance of the Defendants Cargill, Inc. and Cargill Turkey Production, LLC, taken in the above-styled and -numbered cause on the 8th day of April, 2009, A.D., beginning at 1:24 p.m., before Lisa Smith, a Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of Texas, in the offices of Rhodes, Hieronymus, Jones, Tucker & Gable, PLLC, located at 100 West Fifth Street, Suite 400, Tulsa, Oklahoma, in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the agreement hereinafter set forth.

Walker Declaration Exhibit 13

```
1
                            APPEARANCES
2
         FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
 3
              MR. VAUGHN ISKANIAN
              Riggs, Abney, Neal, Turpen, Orbison & Lewis, PC
4
              502 West Sixth Street
              Tulsa, Oklahoma 74119-1010
5
              (918) 587-3161
              (918) 587-9708 (Fax)
6
         FOR THE DEFENDANTS CARGILL, INC. AND CARGILL TURKEY
7
         PRODUCTION, LLC:
              MS. THERESA N. HILL
8
              Rhodes, Hieronymus, Jones, Tucker & Gable, PLLC
9
              100 West Fifth Street, Suite 400
              Tulsa, Oklahoma 74103-4287
              (918) 582-1173
10
              (918) 592-3390 (Fax)
11
         FOR THE DEFENDANTS GEORGE'S, INC. AND GEORGE'S FARMS,
         INC.:
12
13
              MS. JENNIFER LLOYD
              Bassett Law Firm, LLP
14
              221 North College Avenue
              Fayetteville, Arkansas 72702
15
              (479) 521-9996
16
         FOR THE DEFENDANT PETERSON FARMS, INC:
17
              MR. CRAIG A. MIRKES
              McDaniel, Hixon, Longwell & Acord, PLLC
18
              320 South Boston Avenue, Suite 700
              Tulsa, Oklahoma
19
              (918) 382-9200
              (918) 382-9282 (Fax)
20
21
         ALSO PRESENT:
22
              ANN DAVIS - Videographer
23
24
25
```

1	INDEX
2	Appearances
3	Exhibit Index Page 04
4	Examination by Ms. Hill Page 05
5	Examination by Ms. Lloyd Page 59
6	Examination by Mr. Mirkes Page 63
7	Further Examination by Ms. Hill Page 82
8	Examination by Mr. Iskanian Page 82
9	Further Examination by Mr. Mirkes Page 84
10	Reporter's Certificate Page 85
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

			4
	EXHIBIT LIST		
		Page	Page
No.	Description	Mrk'd	Ident.
1	Subpoena	05	07
	-		
2	Blank Investigation Forms	16	16
3	Investigation Forms and Photographs	53	54
4	Investigation Forms	44	45
5	Investigation Form and Photographs	69	69
6	Investigation Form and Photographs	76	76
	1 2 3 4 5	No. Description  1 Subpoena  2 Blank Investigation Forms  3 Investigation Forms and Photographs  4 Investigation Forms  5 Investigation Form and Photographs	No. Description Mrk'd  1 Subpoena 05  2 Blank Investigation Forms 16  3 Investigation Forms and Photographs 53  4 Investigation Forms 44  5 Investigation Form and Photographs 69

1 PROCEEDINGS 2 (Exhibit No. 1 was marked.) 3 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is Tape No. 1 in the videotaped deposition of Jack Walton in the matter of State 4 5 of Oklahoma versus Tyson Foods, being heard before the District Court in the United States of America, Case File 6 7 No. 05-CV-0329 GKF-PJC. This deposition is being held at 100 West Fifth, Suite 400, Tulsa, Oklahoma on 4/8/09 at 8 9 1:24 p.m. 10 My name is Ann Davis. The court reporter is 11 Lisa Smith. Counsel, please introduce yourselves and 12 13 affiliations and the witness will be sworn. 14 MS. HILL: Theresa Hill for Cargill, Inc. and 15 Cargill Turkey Production, LLC. MS. LLOYD: Jennifer Lloyd for George's Inc. 16 17 MR. MIRKES: Craig Mirkes for Peterson Farms. 18 MR. ISKANIAN: Vaughn Iskanian for the State 19 from Riggs Abney law firm. 20 JACK WALTON, 21 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: EXAMINATION 22 BY MS. HILL: 23 Q. Mr. Walton, again on the record, my name is 24 25 Theresa Hill. We met for the first time a few minutes ago

in my office; is that correct?

A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. All right. I know you've probably given sworn testimony on several occasions before. But for the purposes of this record, I'd like to go over our ground rules today. Is that all right?
  - A. Sure.
- Q. If you answer one of my questions, I'm going to assume that you understood the question. Is that --
  - A. Yes.
- Q. -- fair? If you don't understand a question, please stop me ask, ask me to ask it again and I'll try to do a better job of asking a question that you can understand.
  - A. Okay.
- Q. The court reporter will need your verbal response. You're doing a good job of giving yeses -- yeses here. If you'll try to give yeses rather than nods or uh-huhs or huh-uhs.
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Thank you. And if you need to take a break at any time, that's perfectly fine. Let's answer the question that's pending, if there is one. Other than that, we can -- we can take a break whenever -- whenever you'd like to.

A. Okay.

- Q. All right. If you take a look at what the court reporter has marked as Exhibit 1 here. And identify that for the record, please.
- A. It is a copy of -- I'm assuming a copy of the subpoena that I received approximately a week ago to appear here today.
- Q. Okay. And below the box that says that Rhodes Hieronymus, there's another box that says -- that is checked for production. Did you bring any documents or other information responsive to the subpoena with you today?
  - A. No.
- Q. Why did you not bring any documents with you today?
- A. The only documents I had were 1099s for payment and they are in storage right now. And I have broken my left wrist about six weeks ago, so I can't move boxes off of boxes in order to dig down in there. If you need them, I can get them at a later date, but that is all the documentation I had. We didn't keep any of the other. We turned it in at the end of the day.
- Q. Okay. Do you have any e-mails relating to your work on this project?
  - A. Not that I'm aware of, no.

Q. Did you ever use e-mail with respect to your work on this project?

- A. The only thing I can think of, and I can't guarantee that we did it, is if one of the other people that was going to Arkansas with us e-mailed me and asked me if I could go. But we never gave any information as far as what we -- what we saw or did when we were there. Just if I could go. And I'm not even sure that happened, but I don't really remember.
- Q. Did you do any work on a computer relating to this case?
  - A. No.

- Q. What did you do to prepare for your deposition today?
- A. Nothing. Oh, I'm sorry. We had a meeting last week with the State for the -- the law firm that represents the State that lasted about 15 minutes, just to kind of get us to prepare for this. And that was all.
- Q. Okay. Were you at one of the group meetings with other persons?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And I believe Mr. Garren on behalf -- from Riggs Abney represents the State was at the meeting?
- A. If you say so, yes. I don't remember -- I'm a great face person, but not real good with names.

- Q. As you recall, there was one attorney from a law firm representing the State of Oklahoma at this meeting?
  - A. As I recall, yes.
  - Q. Okay. And what were you told at this meeting?

    MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

Go ahead and answer.

- A. Okay. Basically we just reviewed the facts, kind of -- of what we were going to do to prepare and some things that -- for example, the only documentation that we had had to show that we were there were the 1099s, that we turned all of that documentation at the end of -- end of each trip that we took. That was about it. It was a very short meeting.
- Q. (BY MS. HILL) Was there any discussion of any electronically stored information?
  - A. No.
- Q. And was there any discussion about the subject matter of the deposition for today?
- A. Well, we were there to -- because of the deposition, so I'm probably gonna say yes, but I don't remember anything being pertinent.
- Q. All right. And did you talk with anyone else, other than the persons at this meeting, in preparation for your deposition today?
  - A. No, I did not.

10

1 All right. The attorney or attorneys who were at this meeting in preparation for this deposition, had you 2 had occasion to meet with these attorneys on any prior 3 occasion? 4 That was the first time I had met them. 5 A. No. And I understand you are with the Tulsa Police 6 7 Department now. 8 Α. Yes. 9 Okay. Can you give me a brief description of your education prior to entering the police force here in Tulsa. 10 I graduated from the University of Arkansas with 11 Bachelor's degree in criminal justice. 12 13 Ο. Where did you go to high school? 14 Α. Jenks. 15 Did you grow up in Tulsa? Q. Since four years old, yes. 16 17 At the University of Arkansas, did you study any environmental sciences? 18 19 No. Α. 20 Give me a brief overview of your work experience 21 for the Tulsa Police Department. I've worked in the capacity of field officer, 22 23 detective, then promoted to sergeant where I have worked in internal affairs and I've also supervised field officers

and right now I'm the sergeant of the family violence unit.

24

1 Q. Okay. 2 Been there for -- be 20 years in September. Α. Q. Where did you work before joining the Tulsa Police 3 Department? 4 5 I -- straight out of college. Would it be fair to characterize your work 6 7 experience as being in an urban area rather than rural? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. In your work as an investigator for the Tulsa Police Department, did you do investigative work? 10 11 Yes. Α. 12 Okay. And you continue to do investigative work? Q. 13 Α. Yes. Are you involved with any investigations of any 14 agricultural matters? 15 16 No. Α. 17 Q. No agricultural crimes? 18 Α. No. 19 How about investigating -- any investigation of 20 any poultry operations prior to your work on this case? 21 No. Α. Okay. Any experience in agriculture generally? 22 Q. 23 None. Α. 24 I have to go through all of these. Q. 25 That's fine. Α.

- Q. Any experience in ranching and farming?
- A. My uncle owned a sod farm, but no.
- Q. And prior to your involvement in this case, did you have any knowledge about the poultry growing operations in Arkansas or Oklahoma?
  - A. No.

- Q. Tell me about how you know Steve Steele.
- A. Steve -- I've known Steve for almost 20 years.

  Recently he was my major, who is my commander in the detective division, and then recently retired, I believe about six or eight months ago. And he had asked me to go to Arkansas and help him with this documentation of some the chicken waste, litter.
- Q. How is it that he described this project to you when he first approached you?
- A. If I remember correctly, it was pretty simple. He said we were gonna go over to Arkansas and we were documenting -- my big part in it was we were documenting where the chicken farms were and trying to determine whether or not they were active chicken farms. I believe only one time that I went over there were we specifically looking for people spreading litter. Most of my -- most of my involvement was we were just trying to find where the chicken farms were located based on aerial maps and then determine whether or not those were active, because some

Electronically signed by Lisa Smith (601-374-084-6632)

13

1 were abandoned and obviously not active. 2 Okay. I'll ask you a little bit more about that work in a few minutes. 3 4 A. Okay. 5 The one time that you were sent to Arkansas to seek out land application --6 7 Α. Yes. 8 -- do you recall where you -- where you went? 9 A. No. I never drove, so I never quite figured out the directions over there, because a lot of it was mostly 10 11 dirt roads. And the people that had been over there more than I -- I only rode with three people when I was there, 12 13 Steve Steele, Rod Hummel and Shane Tuell, and I only rode with him one time. So no, I really don't -- I can tell you 14 15 Northwest Arkansas and that was about all I know. Q. Do you know how is -- how Steve or others got the 16 17 information about this potential land application that you 18 were going to observe? 19 A. No, I don't. 20 MR. ISKANIAN: Object form. 21 THE WITNESS: Sorry. 22 No, I don't. 23 (BY MS. HILL) And what year was this observation,

I believe my participation was in mid to late 2005

do you -- can you recall that?

24

\_\_\_\_\_\_14

and then I believe only one time in 2006. So I'm gonna say late 2005 or early 2006.

- Q. This one time to go observe land application, do you believe that was in 2006, the one time in 2006 or --
  - A. I really don't know. I don't recall.
- Q. When you went out there, you mentioned several people that -- who you would go with to make these investigations. Did you always go with just one person or did you go with all those persons at one time?
- A. It would kind of depend on the number of people. There were times where more people went than other times. We were always two to a car.
- Q. That was my question. That's what I've understood from prior depositions is there were teams of two.
  - A. Correct.
- Q. So I wanted to make sure that you didn't have a team of three on one occasion.
  - A. No.
- Q. Okay. And what was your job if you weren't the driver?
- A. Basically an observer. I would take pictures of, like I say, mostly what we observed to be active and nonactive chicken houses and make notations in the logbook. Again, mostly to determine whether or not they were active or not active.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

\_\_\_\_\_\_15

1	Q. Were you generally the log keeper, then, if
2	someone else was driving on the farm?
3	A. Some of that would depend on who I was with.
4	Some like Steve Steele was more the note taker than I
5	was. But with Rod Hummel, we'd kind of split it up evenly,
6	so I'm gonna have to say yes and no. It was kind of 50/50.
7	Q. Okay. This one time that you went out to the
8	watershed to see land application, do you recall the
9	grower's name?
10	A. No, I don't.
11	Q. Do you recall the company that that grower had a
12	contract with to raise poultry?
13	A. No.
14	Q. Do you recall what type of poultry operation it
15	was?
16	A. No.
17	Q. Remember anything remarkable about that
18	observation?
19	A. No.
20	Q. Okay. In your work for the Tulsa Police
21	Department, have you had any environmental training?
22	A. We've had some Hazmat training for hazardous
23	materials, but that's just for our safety and it's limited.
24	Q. Have you been involved in any incidents where
25	there have been releases of hazardous materials?

1 Α. No. (Exhibit No. 2 was marked.) 2 I'm gonna ask you to take a look at Exhibit No. 2. 3 Q. These are blank forms and I'll ask you if you recognize 4 this blank form that is Bates numbered OK-PLF 0002252. 5 A. Yes, I do. 6 7 Are these the forms that you would fill out when 8 you were making your observations in the field? 9 Yes, they are. Α. The top box to the right, poultry type, how could 10 11 you determine what poultry type was at this operation or could you? 12 13 A. I don't think I could, no. I -- I -- again, I'm not familiar with every circling one of those, but I won't 14 15 say I didn't, so --Q. Do you have any training in the differences 16 between broilers, layers, pullets and turkeys? 17 18 A. No, not personally. 19 Okay. Tell me about the training, if any, that 20 you received before you went out in the field to fill out 21 these forms? A. None. We were just there to document. 22 23 Q. Did you have any meetings prior to your first trip out to the watershed? 24

25

A. No.

1	Q. Okay. Do you recall your first trip to the
2	watershed?
3	A. Yes.
4	Q. Who were you with that day?
5	A. Rod Hummel.
6	Q. Okay. Anything you recall about that trip?
7	A. I remember thinking I never had any idea there
8	were that many chickens in Northwest Arkansas.
9	Q. You found a few chicken houses that day?
10	A. There were and and then when you when you
11	kind of learn how many chickens are in each house and, you
12	know, things like that, it's it's truly kind of
13	mind-boggling to think that there's that much up there.
14	But and and I remember thinking there's a lot of dirt
15	roads, because we mostly traveled dirt county roads. That
16	was about it.
17	Q. Before your involvement in this case, did you have
18	any idea how many birds would be in a particular house?
19	A. No.
20	Q. Of these types of poultry listed here on the
21	top
22	A. Uh-huh.
23	Q do you have any information about how many, for
24	instance, broilers are in a particular house?
25	A. No. No idea.

1	Q.	And	you	don't	know	how	those	numbers	may	vary	from
2	poultry	type	?								
3	Α.	No.									

- Q. Let's keep going with this form. Did you have any instructions about filling out the good, fair or poor section as it relates to structure?
- A. That was just kind of a -- based on what you saw. It was -- it was pretty easy to determine a good chicken house from -- usually the poors were the ones that weren't up and running and the roofs had collapsed on them and things like that. Whereas the good structures would have a good outside structure, operational curtains on the side, along with the fans on the side were also operational for ventilation. Those would usually get good rankings.
- Q. Okay. But it was completely subjective to determine between good and fair, is that --
  - A. Yes.

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

A. Sorry.

MR. ISKANIAN: May I interject here for a second. When I do object to the form, you can go ahead and answer. But when she asks the question, you might kind of, if you can, wait a split second and let me object if I need to. Okay?

THE WITNESS: Okay.

1	Q. (BY MS. HILL) Over on the right-hand side,
2	there's a category of covered litter/cake storage. What
3	does that refer to?
4	A. It is my understanding that a lot of the litter
5	that is disposed of from the chicken house, they put in
6	what is like a shed with no doors. There's a roof and
7	sides, and they will stack the farmers will stack the
8	litter in that area. That's what
9	Q. Do you have any understanding of what cake is?
10	A. No.
11	Q. Do you know have any knowledge of what a
12	cake-out is?
13	A. No.
14	Q. You don't cannot tell me the difference between
15	a cake-out and a clean-out?
16	A. No.
17	Q. Okay. You just testified that when farmers
18	dispose of litter, what do you mean by dispose of?
19	A. Again, to my knowledge, they push it out of the
20	chicken house once it stacks up in the chicken house and
21	then they move it to this litter shed until they dispose of
22	it another way.
23	Q. Do you have any knowledge about how growers may
24	use litter?
25	A. I know some use it for fertilization.

1	Q. And when you say dispose, are you telling the
2	Court that these growers are throwing it away like you
3	dispose garbage?
4	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
5	A. I don't know. It's however they dispose of it. I
	know some of them spread it for fertilization. Some of
6	-
7	them sell it to others to spread, some of them have other
8	people remove. I just know that's where they put it until
9	it is removed.
10	Q. (BY MS. HILL) When you used the term disposed,
11	you mean just move it out of the house?
12	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
13	A. They move it out of the house to another location
14	until they can remove it from their property all together.
15	Q. (BY MS. HILL) But dispose, you're not telling us
16	that a growers not using that for fertilization or some
17	other beneficial purpose?
18	A. No.
19	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
20	THE WITNESS: Sorry.
21	A. No.
22	Q. (BY MS. HILL) So you don't have any opinions
23	about a grower's use of litter, whether that's beneficial
24	or not?
25	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

21

1	A. No.
2	Q. (BY MS. HILL) And so when you used the term
3	dispose, you're not telling the Court that these growers
4	are are throwing away or disposing of litter like you
5	would garbage?
6	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
7	A. Well, I guess if you could mash your garbage into
8	fertile fertilizer and spread it, then yes, that's
9	exactly how I'm using disposed. They are removing the
10	waste from their property in some form, be it spreading or
11	having somebody else take it off, but yes, they're
12	literally throwing it away, so dispose.
13	Q. (BY MS. HILL) But throwing it away also means
14	using in a manner to fertilize?
15	A. Could.

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

Q. (BY MS. HILL) Or it could mean selling for -- for money?

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

- Α. It could.
- (BY MS. HILL) Okay. So dispose means taking it away and disposing of it out of the house, taking it out of the house. Is that what you mean?
  - A. As far as the litter shed goes, yes.
  - Q. Okay. Dispose just means move it from the litter

Electronically signed by Lisa Smith (601-374-084-6632)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ba754b1d-db96-4215-a248-2de18a75ad45

22

1 shed? I'm -- I'm a little confused. I'm sorry. Let me 2 ask that again. You said dispose as far as the litter shed is 3 concerned. Tell me what you mean by that. 4 5 I mean, I don't know how they dispose of -- how they get rid of it or dispose of it from the litter shed. 6 7 I'm sure they do various things with it, from spreading it 8 themselves to selling it to -- I'm not privy to that --9 Q. Okay. -- information. 10 Α. So the action of disposing of is the removal of 11 the litter from the barns to this stacking shed; is that 12 13 correct? 14 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. 15 A. As far as I'm concerned, yes. (BY MS. HILL) That's how you're using the term 16 dispose here today? 17 18 Α. Yes.

A. Yes

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. Thank you. Let's keep going on this form. Down underneath other, can you tell me your understanding of what stacked used litter/cake is?
- A. My understanding of it is if it's like stacked in a mound in the litter shed or outside the litter shed or wherever it may be stacked. But more than just like a small trace outside the doors from where they had cleaned

1 it out. So there's actual -- there's an amount there 2 stacked. And do you know what stacked used cake is? 3 4 Α. No. 5 Below that stacked new litter, what does that refer to? 6 7 A. I would assume that it is litter that has been recently stacked there. 8 9 And how is that different from the category above? A. Well, I would imagine stacked used litter has been 10 there for some time and stacked new litter would be fresh 11 litter that has been stacked there. 12 13 O. You don't know? 14 A. Well, yeah. There's the difference between used and new. Used would be old litter and new would be new 15 litter is how I --16 17 Q. Did you receive any instructions on when to check 18 new litter versus used litter? 19 A. No. 20 Q. Did you make any observations about how long 21 litter was located in a particular observation --22 particular location? 23 A. I don't recall. It would have been in the notes 24 if I did. 25 Q. So if you're out in the field making an

observation, how is it that you determined whether to check stacked new or just stacked used?

- A. I would -- again, we're talking about 2005, so it's been that long, but I wasn't over there as much as the people that I was with. So I would imagine that I would have a discussion with whoever I was with and if they had seen the old litter there for a while and could identify it as such, we would circle used litter. If it was a new pile -- because some of them were over that literally every day. I wasn't over there nearly that much, so I didn't have any idea about what had been and what hadn't been, unless I had gone two or three consecutive days. And I don't ever recall -- remember going more than two days in a row.
- Q. Do you have any independent recollection of those conversations before filling out stacked new versus stacked used?
  - A. No.
    - Q. Everything would be in the notes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Let's go to the next form. In this Exhibit No. 2, this is marked OK-PL 0001034. Are you familiar with this form?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. And did you use this form?

25

A. I believe so, yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

- Q. And what was the purpose of this form?
- A. Mostly to document our photo frame numbers. We had a digital camera and when we would take pictures, we would do the frame number and it also allowed us to document who was in the vehicle that day and latitude and longitudes of the area that we were in.
- Q. And was this a form that was used in the project to determine whether poultry operations were active or not?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Let's go on to the next page. This is another form we found in the documents. It's marked OK-PL-0005198. Are you familiar with this form?
  - A. Yes.
    - Q. And have you used this form?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And what was the purpose of this form?
- 18 A. Same as before.
- Q. And what did you do with these forms after you made your observations?
- 21 A. At the end of the day or --
- 22 Q. Yes.
- A. Is that -- okay. We turned them back in to
  usually Steve Steele, sometimes I would give them to Rod
  Hummel who would give them to Steve Steele. I never kept

1 any of them at the end of the day. 2 Q. Did you ever receive any feedback or comments on your recordkeeping on these forms? 3 4 Α. No. Were you ever told that any adjustments needed to 5 be made on your recordkeeping on these forms? 6 7 A. Absolutely not. 8 Did you make any oral reports that aren't 9 documented on forms? Not that I recall. 10 Q. To speed things up in our prior depositions, I 11 understand that in the morning you'd receive your 12 13 assignment and forms to go out to a particular location. 14 A. Yes. 15 So you didn't independently make any 16 determinations as to where you would be making your 17 observations? 18 Α. No. 19 That was assigned to you by others? Q. 20 Yes. Α. 21 And do you know who made those assignments? Q. I know that Steve Steele would normally hand 22

everybody out the maps and books and such at the beginning

of the day. Who made those assignments to him, I have no

23

24

25

idea.

1	Q. Okay. Have you had any communications with any
2	other counsel in this case other than Mr. Garren?
3	A. No.
4	Q. Familiar with any of the other attorneys involved
5	in this case?
6	A. No.
7	Q. Have you had communications with the Attorney
8	General's office?
9	A. No.
10	Q. How about do you know Dr. Bert Fisher?
11	A. No.
12	Q. Have you ever heard of Dr. Bert Fisher?
13	A. No.
14	Q. Other than your first meeting with Steve Steele
15	about working on this project, what other communications
16	have you had with Steve Steele on this project?
17	A. Only when he or Rod Hummel would call me and ask
18	me if I could go the following day or the following week
19	with them, that's all.
20	Q. Did Steve or Rod Hummel or anyone else give you
21	any materials to review or look at prior to doing your work
22	in this case?
23	A. For today?
24	Q. No, no. For your work on the project generally.
25	A. No.

1 Did anyone give you any documents --Q. 2 No. Α. Q. Let me finish. 3 4 A. Okay. You know what I'm asking. But did anyone give you 5 any documents for today? 6 7 A. No. Q. Prior to your work on this project, had you ever 8 9 been to the Illinois River Watershed before? A. Not that I recall. I won't say I've never been 10 11 there, but no. 12 Q. Other than traveling to the University of Arkansas and back when you were a student --13 A. Yes. 14 -- had you ever been to the Illinois River before? 15 I think I floated the Illinois River once, but 16 17 I -- again, I can't swear to that. 18 It's not your practice to recreate on the Illinois Q. 19 River? 20 Α. No. 21 Q. How about Lake Tenkiller? 22 A. Been to Tenkiller once or twice, but not in the 23 last 20 years. 24 Q. Is there a reason why you haven't been to Lake 25 Tenkiller in the last 20 years?

1 A. Because we go to Oolagah. 2 Q. Is there a reason why you prefer Oolagah over Lake Tenkiller? 3 A. We have friends that have boats up there. And 4 it's only like 20 minutes from the house, Oolagah. 5 Q. As you became more familiar with Illinois River 6 7 Watershed from your work on this project, did you learn where the boundaries of the Watershed were located? 8 9 A. No. If you saw a map today, could you tell me where 10 the Illinois --11 12 A. Probably not. 13 Ο. -- River Watershed boundaries were located? 14 Probably not. Α. 15 I'll try to get my questions out --Q. Sorry. I'm so used to doing it. 16 17 I know. Q. 18 I'm usually the one asking the questions, so I 19 apologize for jumping in. 20 Q. And opposing counsel may want to object some as 21 well, so we'll try to slow down a little bit. Okay. 22 Α. 23 And as you testified before, you have no prior experience with the poultry business? 24

A. No, none at all.

25

30

1	Q. Did you receive any training about poultry
2	operations with in connection with your work on this
3	project?
4	A. No.
5	Q. Through your work on this project, did you learn
6	about litter management, such as clean-out practices of
7	growers?
8	A. Maybe a little bit.
9	Q. Did you I think you told me earlier you don't
LO	know the difference between a full clean-out and and a
11	cake-out.
L2	A. Correct.
L3	Q. Okay. How about the frequency of cleaning out,
L4	did you learn anything about how often growers clean out?
L5	A. No. About the only thing I really learned was the
L6	different methods. I know smaller houses, they would
L7	scrape kind of with a shovel whereas maybe bigger houses
18	they'd use a Bobcat-type device and, you know, push out,
L9	but that's about my limited knowledge on that.
20	Q. Did you learn about how growers deal with their
21	poultry mortality?
22	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

Q. (BY MS. HILL) How they manage the mortality of

A. Are you asking me what they do with the dead

23

24

25

poultry?

1 chickens or --Did you learn what growers do with dead chickens? 2 Q. A. Not specifically, no. 3 Are you aware of different methods that growers 4 use to deal with their dead chickens? 5 A. The -- the one that I'm -- I'm most familiar with 6 7 is incineration. I know that a lot of them put them in an incinerator and that's just because the incinerator is on 8 9 the property, so that's all I know about it. Q. Do you know how turkey growers deal with dead 10 11 turkeys? A. If it's not the same, then no. 12 13 Q. Okay. Did you observe any composting of 14 mortality? 15 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. If you're asking if I saw dead chickens, yes, I 16 17 did. 18 Q. (BY MS. HILL) All right. Did you observe dead 19 chickens being used for compost? 20 I'm gonna say no. Α. 21 Did you observe compost piles or composting O. facilities? 22 A. If I did, it's in the notes. 23 24 Q. Do you have any independent recollection of 25 composting -- composting done by growers in the Illinois

1	River Watershed?
2	A. Not that I recall.
3	Q. How about burial of dead poultry, did you see any
4	of that?
5	A. Not that I recall.
6	Q. If you did, it would be in the notes?
7	A. It would be in the notes.
8	Q. Are you aware of the differences between how
9	chickens and turkeys may be raised?
10	A. Maybe. I'm not real sure what you're asking. I
11	know you have, like, housed chickens and free range
12	chickens and things like that. And but as far as
13	specifics, no.
14	Q. Okay. When you went out and observed these
15	houses, could you tell whether they were for chickens or
16	turkeys?
17	A. No.
18	Q. And I would imagine then you could not tell
19	whether they were brood houses or grow-out houses?
20	A. No idea, no.
21	Q. Okay. Do you have any specific training in
22	Oklahoma environmental laws?
23	A. No.
24	Q. Do you have any knowledge of the statutes and
25	regulations in Oklahoma dealing with the transportation of

1 litter? 2 No. Α. And here I'm talking about poultry litter. 3 Q. 4 Α. No. Do you have any knowledge of the statutes and 5 regulations dealing with certification of land, persons who 6 7 land apply poultry litter? 8 A. No. 9 Q. Do you have any knowledge of the statutes and regulations relating to land application of poultry litter 10 11 generally? 12 A. No. Do you have any -- are you familiar with animal 13 14 waste management plans in Oklahoma? 15 Α. No. 16 Have you ever seen an animal waste management 17 plan? 18 Α. A, P-L-A-N, plan, or P-L-A-N-T, plant. 19 An animal waste management plan, P-L-A-N? Ο. 20 Α. No. 21 Are you familiar with any Arkansas environmental Q. 22 laws? 23 No. Α. 24 And are you familiar with any Arkansas statutes or 25 regulations dealing with the transportation of poultry

1	litter?	
2	Α.	No.
3	Q.	Are you familiar with any Arkansas laws addressing
4	the land	application of litter generally?
5	Α.	No.
6	Q.	Are you aware of any Arkansas laws addressing the
7	applicat	ion of any kind of nutrients on the ground?
8	Α.	No.
9	Q.	And have you ever seen a nutrient management plan?
LO	Α.	No.
11	Q.	Do you know what a nutrient management plan is?
12	Α.	Not a clue.
L3	Q.	Do you know what an animal waste management plan
L4	is?	
15	Α.	Not a clue.
16	Q.	Okay. Have any scientific training, then, in
L7	nutrients	s that in nutrients?
18	Α.	No.
L9	Q.	Okay. Any training in phosphates versus
20	phosphore	ous?
21	Α.	No.
22	Q.	Any scientific training in the fate and transport
23	of nutrie	ents?
24	Α.	No.
25	Q.	Have any scientific training in application rates

of nutrients on -- on the ground?

- A. No.
- Q. Have you ever used the term over application?
- A. No.

- Q. Do you know what that refers to?
- A. Just from basic, I mean, the word over-application, not in relation to chicken litter or anything else, though.
- Q. Would you be able to identify over-application from poultry litter?
- A. I know that when they put a lot of application down, it will burn the grass versus making it greener. It will kill it. So professionally no, I could not tell you what over-application was. I could give a layman's opinion and that is all.
- Q. Did you see any burning of grass occur in your observation?
- A. Yes. And mostly you can see it in the aerial photographs. It's more difficult to detect from eye level, you know, driving in a car, but mostly I picked it up in the aerial photographs. You could see the circles where they would apply litter and turn around and drive back to the other end, apply litter, turn around and drive back to the other end.
  - Q. And you saw this when you observed an aerial

1 photograph; is that your testimony? 2 Yes. Α. Did you go up in the plane at all? 3 Q. 4 Α. No. 5 And where did you obtain these aerial photographs? I believe they were given to me as a team at the 6 Α. 7 beginning of the day by Steve Steele. 8 Q. Okay. So did you do any investigation of these 9 areas of over-application of -- that you have described as having burnt areas? 10 11 A. No. You could just see them in the picture. We 12 didn't go there and specifically investigate if there was 13 over-application. 14 Q. Okay. So you're not aware of the crop that was 15 being grown in that area? 16 A. No. 17 Q. And you -- you don't know what type of grass might 18 have been used there? 19 Α. No. 20 And you didn't do any sampling in the areas? Q. 21 No. Α. 22 Did -- were you involved in any sampling 23 whatsoever? 24 A. Never. 25 Q. Did you see any taking place?

1 A. No. Q. So these burned areas -- do you recall seeing 2 3 any -- any of these areas of perhaps burnt grasses or crops from the ground? 4 5 A. No. Q. Okay. So you didn't independently observe this 6 7 when you -- with your own eyes in the Watershed, you just 8 saw it in the pictures? 9 A. In aerial photographs, yes. We didn't ever go on someone's property, so it would have been very difficult 10 11 to, you know, walk up on the grass and see exactly what it was like. We tried -- we stayed on the main roads and the 12 13 country roads and all of that. 14 Q. And those were your instructions; right? 15 A. Yes. I may have asked you this already. Did you talk 16 to any growers while you were out in the Watershed? 17 18 A. No, I personally didn't. 19 Were you with anyone when they talked --Ο. 20 No. Α. 21 -- spoke with a grower? Q.

2324

22

A. Sorry.

No.

Α.

Q.

- 25
- Q. We're trying to get through this quickly.

I'll try to get the question out.

1 Sorry. Α. 2 How about, did you follow any litter trucks? Q. 3 Yes. Α. Okay. Who did you follow? 4 Ο. I don't recall. 5 Α. Could you identify the trucks? 6 Q. 7 Α. When we were following them or now? 8 O. Yes. Were there -- were there signs or markings 9 on the trucks that indicated whether they were with a particular company? 10 A. On some of the trucks, I believe there were, yes. 11 And that's all in the notes on -- for that specific day. 12 13 Q. Do you have any independent recollection of any 14 litter hauling companies who you may have watched in the 15 Watershed? A. No, I don't. 16 Q. So whatever is in the notes --17 18 Α. That is correct. 19 Did -- did you have occasion to speak with any Ο. 20 litter haulers in the watershed? 21 Α. No. Did you have occasion to speak with anyone that 22 23 was involved in the poultry industry in any way when you were in the Watershed? 24 25 A. Not that I recall.

39

- 1 Q. All right. Did you do any other work on this 2 project, other than the observations that were made in the Illinois River Watershed? 3 4 Α. No. 5 Did you serve any subpoenas in this case? 6 Α. No. 7 You testified earlier that you on occasion followed litter trucks. How far would you follow those 8 9 litter hauling trucks? To my recollection, most of -- I should say most 10 11 of, I'll bet I personally when I was with the others, 12 because I wasn't driving, I was always a passenger, so 13 probably maybe less than 10 at the -- at the most. And 14 normally they would pick up the litter and go to spread
  - Q. Did you record the mileage of -- from the pickup's location to the application site?

within a mile or two, so we never followed them very far.

- A. I don't recall.
- Q. You don't have any independent recollection of making that recording?
- A. No. I did it so infrequently. Like I said earlier, most of my time over there was spent finding the houses and determining if they were active or not.
- Q. Did you note any large -- large trucks hauling litter long distances?

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 If I did, it's in the notes, but I don't 2 independently recall any. Do you have any knowledge of BMP, Inc.? 3 4 Α. No. 5 Do you have knowledge of any company that hauled litter long distances? 6 7 Α. No. And was it your testimony earlier that you 8 9 observed land application of litter on one occasion? That I recall, yes. 10 11 Okay. And did you do anything to measure the rate of application? 12 13 Α. No. And you testified earlier that you can't -- did 14 15 not determine the type of litter that was being applied? 16 Α. No. Did you measure the distance from -- from that 17 18 land application location to any water body? 19 No. Α. 20 Did you make any notes as to land type or geology 21 in the area? Not that I recall, but if I did it's in the notes. 22 23 And you didn't test any of the soil? Ο. 24 No. Α. 25 Did not collect any samples on the edge of the

1 fields? 2 Α. No. Q. Did you observe and note transportation of hay in 3 or out of the IRW? IRW -- I'm sorry. I'm referring to 4 Illinois River Watershed. 5 A. Not that I recall. Probably did, because it is 6 7 such a farmers' area, but I don't specifically remember 8 any. 9 Q. Do you remember making any specific notes about land available for cattle and grazing? 10 11 No. Α. Q. Did your instructions ever include documenting 12 13 stream banks? 14 No. Α. 15 Q. How about cattle? 16 Α. No. 17 Q. Did you have the occasion to see a lot of cattle 18 in the Watershed? 19 A. Again, being farmland in Northwest Arkansas, I'm 20 sure there were cattle there, but we weren't -- I wasn't 21 looking for cattle. I was looking for chicken houses. Q. Did you ever receive any instructions to observe 22

or document the recreational use in the area?

Q. Did you have any instructions to observe and

23

24

25

Α.

No.

42

1 document any septic systems in the area? 2 Α. No. Did you ever receive any instructions to observe 3 and document wastewater treatment facilities in the area? 4 5 A. No. Did you have any instructions to observe and 6 7 document commercial fertilizer use in the area? 8 Α. No. 9 Q. Did you have any instructions to observe and document urban run-off in the area? 10 11 No. Α. Did you document any urban run-off in the area? 12 Q. 13 Α. No. 14 Q. Do you know what's referred to as urban run-off? 15 No. Α. Do you have any idea what run-off of a field is? 16 I would assume it's like rain run-off into a water 17 18 area once. And the -- whatever was in that field, be it 19 litter or fertilizer or whatever, that it runs off in --20 kind of like the run-off in your yard at home. 21 Q. Did you observe any urban run-off or agricultural run-off? 22 Not that I recall. 23 Α. 24 Q. You weren't out there in the rain, were you? 25 A. Maybe once, maybe. And I don't even remember if

1	it started raining after we were already there or if it was
2	raining when we got there. I just remember driving through
3	the muddy roads.
4	Q. Steve Steele testified that if it was a rainy day,
5	that you generally stayed home. Is that your recollection?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. And on this day that you ran into some rain or
8	or got a little bit wet and muddy, what were you doing that
9	day; do you recall?
10	A. Again, the majority of my time over there was
11	spent looking for active and inactive chicken houses. I
12	would assume that.
13	Q. So you don't believe that you you observed any
14	land application on this day that you saw had rain?
15	A. No, I don't think so.
16	Q. And do you have any independent recollection of
17	observing any any run-off from any fields?
18	A. No.
19	Q. We can go through some notes later, but can you
20	give me a ballpark of how many times you think you were out
21	there making these observations?
22	A. If I had to guess, probably 20, maybe.
23	Q. In all of your time in the Watershed, did you
24	observe anyone breaking the law?
25	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

1	A. Well, we weren't there to determine legality, so I
2	really don't know. They could have been and I I did not
3	know the whatever law they were breaking, so
4	Q. (BY MS. HILL) In your 20 plus years as a Tulsa
5	police officer, you can't tell me whether you saw someone
6	breaking a law out there when you were making your
7	observations in the Watershed?
8	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
9	A. My I not not environmental law, no, I
10	can't.
11	Q. (BY MS. HILL) I I asked about law generally.
12	A. Oh, in general? Oh, if you're talking about
13	somebody not using their indicator when they turned onto a
14	county road, sure, I can tell you that.
15	Q. Did you observe any contract growers doing
16	anything that looked like a violation of the law to you?
17	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
18	A. Again, we weren't there to determine legality.
19	Was there something that was blatantly obvious? No. But I
20	don't know, again, all the laws that pertain to poultry and
21	turkeys and litter and that's not my area of expertise.
22	Q. (BY MS. HILL) I'm gonna skip around and give you
23	Exhibit No. 4. We'll come back to 3.
24	A. All right.
25	(Exhibit No. 4 was marked.)

1	Q. I'm gonna hand you what the court reporter has
2	marked as Exhibit No. 4. Go over a few questions with you
3	about these forms.
4	A. Okay.
5	Q. I'll represent to you these are the forms I found
6	with your name on them that related to any Cargill notes
7	that had any Cargill notation on them.
8	A. Okay.
9	Q. The first page is an observation from June 16th,
LO	2005; is that correct?
11	A. Yes.
L2	Q. Were you involved in this observation?
L3	A. Yes.
L4	Q. Did you make the notes on this observation?
L5	A. Yes.
L6	Q. Do you have any independent recollection of this
L7	observation of the Wamoth Farm noted here on Page
18	OK-PL-000796?
L9	A. No.
20	Q. Did you make the notes on this form?
21	A. Yes, I did.
22	Q. I'm gonna hand you the pictures also I only
23	have one copy that were associated with that note.
24	A. Okay.
25	Q. And take a look at those and then I'll ask you

1 some questions. 2 Α. Okay. Did you observe that this was an active operation? 3 Yes. That's what the notes say. 4 5 And your second handwritten note under notes, fresh litter track from door area. What does that refer 6 7 to? Are these photos labeled as far as frame number? 8 9 Q. We had to match them up. I'll represent to you that I believe the second photo here --10 Okay. 11 Α. 12 O. -- which is marked OK-PL-0008941 is associated 13 with your second note there. 14 A. Okay. Then in the photo, you can just see the 15 very, very edge of the door here on the right frame --Q. Uh-huh. 16 17 A. -- and then the fresh -- what appears to be fresh 18 litter trailing out from that door. That would be what the 19 fresh litter track from door area would be. 20 Q. Okay. Does it look like they were actively 21 cleaning out or removing litter from this operation? I don't know. It doesn't --22 23 Q. If Mr. Hummel testified earlier today that the 24 litter was removed from this area, do you have anything

that contradicts his recollection?

25

47 1 The litter as in a litter stack was removed from 2 the area or --Q. Or this picture that you're looking at -- at 8941 3 shows where litter was removed from -- from a house. 4 5 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. 6 And your question was, do I have anything to 7 contradict that information? Q. (BY MS. HILL) Yes. 8 9 A. No, I don't. You don't have any independent recollection of 10 11 this observation? No. And again, this could -- he could have been 12 there the day before and there was a stack of litter and 13 14 then I rode with him the next day and it was gone, so I don't know. 15

- Q. You don't know what's on this track coming out of this house, do you?
  - A. No.
- Q. And looking at these pictures in this note, do you note anything improper happening or taking place on this land?
  - MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
  - A. Again, I don't know.
- Q. (BY MS. HILL) Is there anything unusual about the observations made here on the Wamoth Farm?

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

48

1 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. 2 Well, the only thing that makes me believe this is litter is usually the chicken litter would be in a darker 3 color than mud or the area around it. And there was also a 4 5 smell. Usually I would document the smell, but I could have done that with just fresh, fresh litter, so just the 6 7 apparent chicken litter coming out from the door. 8 Q. (BY MS. HILL) And again, you don't know whether 9 that is chicken litter, turkey litter or something else? A. No, I don't. 10 Q. Anything -- no -- other than what we've discussed 11 relating to this picture No. 8941, that is noteworthy about 12 13 your observations of the Wamoth Farm? 14 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. 15 No. Α. (BY MS. HILL) Okay. I'll take the pictures. 16 Q. 17 Okay. Α. 18 Let's turn the page. The next page of this exhibit is OK-Pl-0001935. Were you involved in this 19 20 observation?

- 21
- Α.
- 22 23
- Yes. Α.
- 24 25
- Do you have any independent recollection of this observation?

Did you make the notes on this observation?

4 Q

1	A. No.
2	Q. Anything unusual or out of the ordinary about your
3	notes on this observation?
4	A. No.
5	Q. Did you note any improper activity in this
6	observation?
7	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
8	A. No.
9	Q. (BY MS. HILL) Let's go on to the next page.
10	That's OK-PL-0002582. Were you involved in this
11	observation?
12	A. Yes.
13	Q. Did you make the notes on this observation?
14	A. Yes.
15	Q. You noted the structures were in good condition?
16	A. Yes.
17	Q. Do you have any independent recollection of this
18	observation, other than what is contained in the note here?
19	A. No.
20	Q. Do you recall whether you ever went back to the
21	Rutherford Farm?
22	A. I don't recall.
23	Q. If you did, it would be in a note; is that
24	correct?
25	A. I would think so, yes.

50

1	Q. Is there anything unusual that you noticed about
2	the Rutherford Farm here on Page 2582?
3	A. No.
4	Q. And you did not note anything improper?
5	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
6	A. No.
7	Q. (BY MS. HILL) Let's go on to the next page, 2607.
8	Were you involved in this observation?
9	A. Yes.
LO	Q. And what did you observe?
11	A. That there was no public access to the farm and we
L2	took a picture of the sign, which I'm sure denoted it as a
L3	turkey farm, which is why I wrote turkey farm. And we
L4	didn't we didn't encroach on private property to try to
L5	get a photo of a specific building. We stayed on public
L6	access.
L7	Q. So you really didn't have any observation here; is
L8	that correct?
L9	A. No. I'm pretty sure we we took a photo from an
20	aerial photograph, again, that, you know, pin-pointed an
21	area and then we went to that area. And since we couldn't
22	get close to it, we took a picture of the sign showing that
23	it was a turkey farm and moved on.
24	Q. Okay. Let's go on to the next page, 2652. Were

you involved in this observation?

1 Yes. Α. 2 And did you make the notes on this observation? Q. 3 Yes. Α. And what are you observing in this -- this note? 4 5 Again, that it was a turkey farm and that there was just a partial view of it. 6 7 Q. Do you have any independent recollection of this observation? 8 9 No. Α. Anything unusual about the activities you noted on 10 this farm? 11 12 Α. No. 13 Q. Let's go on to the next page. Were you involved 14 in the observation noted here at Page 2703? 15 Α. Yes. Did you make the notes on this observation? 16 17 Yes. Α. 18 Do you have any independent recollection of this observation? 19 20 A. No. 21 Generally what did you observe here? Q. That it appeared active with silos and propane 22 23 tanks and that there's a litter shack and a spreader. 24 Q. Did you note anything unusual on the Ginn Farm? 25 No. Α.

1 Q. Did you note anything improper? MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. 2 Again, not knowing all the litter disposal laws, I 3 wouldn't know what was proper and what was improper. 4 5 Q. (BY MS. HILL) So we're not gonna get any testimony from you at any time about how litter should be 6 7 used, disposed or placed? 8 A. No. Because that wasn't my job of going over 9 there. Okay. Let's go on to the next page, 3712. 10 11 Okay. Α. You were involved in this observation; is that 12 Q. 13 correct? 14 A. Yes. 15 And did you make the notes on this observation? Q. Yes. 16 Α. 17 Do you have any independent recollection of this 18 observation? 19 A. No. 20 If you returned to Swearingen Farm at another 21 time, would there be a note on it? There may not be a note on this form, but there 22 23 would be a note somewhere on a form that we returned to it. 24 Q. Do you recall returning to the Swearingen Farm? 25 No. Α.

1	Q. Is there anything unusual about the activities you
2	noted at the Swearingen Farm on September 1st, 2005?
3	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
4	A. No.
5	Q. (BY MS. HILL) Page 3370, were you involved in
6	this observation?
7	A. Yes.
8	Q. Did you make the notes on this observation?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. Do you have any independent recollection of this
11	observation?
12	A. No.
13	Q. Do you recall ever going back to the Eddleman
14	Farm?
15	A. No.
16	Q. Is there anything unusual about the activities you
17	noted at the Eddleman Farm on September 16th, 2005?
18	A. No.
19	MS. HILL: Mark this Exhibit 3.
20	(Exhibit No. 3 was marked.)
21	Q. This one's Exhibit 3. I'm gonna hand you what the
22	court reporter has marked as Exhibit 3. Would you take a
23	few minutes and look through this exhibit.
24	A. Okay.
25	Q. On the second page of this exhibit, 5666

1 Α. Yes. 2 Q. -- does it indicate that you're involved in this observation? 3 4 Α. Yes. 5 And you made the notes to this observation? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Q. Who did you make this observation with? 8 Α. Steve Steele. 9 Okay. And the first page of this exhibit, were you involved in the creation of these maps? 10 11 No. Α. 12 Q. Have you ever seen those before? Maybe. I saw a lot of aerial photographs. This 13 could have been one of them, but no, I don't recall it. 14 15 In your note on Page 5661 --Q. 16 Yes. Α. 17 Q. -- when you note that there was litter being 18 dumped or dumping litter --19 Α. Yes. 20 Q. -- what are you referring to? 21 That a truck was dumping litter from the truck and spreading -- I'm assuming. I'd have to look at the picture 22 23 that I was referring to on this, but that it was spreading 24 it from a rear spreader on the truck. 25 Q. Steve testified yesterday that when he said

55

dumping, that means it came from a truck that couldn't be used to spread, it was -- it was moving litter. Does that comport with your memory?

- A. Maybe, sure.
- Q. That works?
- A. Yeah.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. You don't have any -- okay.
- A. He was over there so much more, I'm sure he probably uses a different terminology than I do, so --
- Q. So here can you tell whether you were observing land application or the movement of litter or land application versus just the movement of litter?
- A. Is that just in the pages back to the next notation where I took -- or the next page I took notes or all of these pictures compared to that one?
  - Q. I think on this first note --
- A. Because on the first note, I only have three pictures.
  - Q. Right.
  - A. Right.
- Q. And it looks like there are three pictures following that. I'll represent to you that we matched up the photo frame numbers and found these three pictures and believe that these relate to your note on 5666, the three notes that follow that. So the note on the Cargill farm on

5666 has three pictures associated with it, the three pictures following.

A. Okay.

- Q. And -- so I'm asking about these three pictures. Here are you documenting the movement of litter or the land application of litter in Note 5666? Just 5666 and the three pictures associated with it.
- A. Okay. Without remembering this specifically, I will go with Steve's definition of moving of litter, because again, I'm -- there's no way for me to know that these pictures are matched up to the appropriate notations because the photo files are not stamped on there in any way. So I can't directly compare photo frame with 5577 with the first picture and know that that is the picture I took to go with that notation.
- Q. But there are no pictures or notes on Page 5666 relating to land application; is that correct?
  - MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
- Q. (BY MS. HILL) Do you see any note relating to land application on 5666?
  - A. No.
- Q. Going on to 5661. Is this the one occasion that you had to observe land application that's described here on 5661?
- 25 A. Actually, I think I said that I remember --

1	specifically remember one occasion and if there were more,
2	that they would be in the notes. So I'm assuming this was
3	the one that was in the notes, because I was with Steve
4	Steele and the one I specifically remember, I was with
5	Shane Tuell.
6	Q. Okay. So you don't have any independent
7	recollection of what is noted here on Page 5661?
8	A. No.
9	Q. And if you went back to this location at a later
10	date, there would be a note about it?
11	A. Yes.
12	Q. And the pictures following Page 5661, does that do
13	anything to refresh your recollection about what you
14	observed on 5661?
15	A. No. Other than just there was a spreader truck
16	out in the field. It appeared to be dumping or I'm
17	sorry spreading litter.
18	Q. Did you receive any materials about calibrating
19	litter trucks?
20	A. No.
21	Q. Did you receive any training or materials on
22	litter application rates?
23	A. No.
24	Q. Is there anything, I believe you used the term
25	earlier, blatantly obvious or unusual about the notes here

```
1
         we see in Exhibit No. 3?
 2
              A. No.
 3
                       MS. HILL: Mr. Walton, I'm gonna take a quick
         break and look at my notes and see where we are.
 4
 5
                       THE WITNESS: Okay.
                       THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're off the record at
 6
 7
         2:34 p.m.
                  (Break was taken from 2:34 p.m. to 2:39 p.m.)
 8
 9
                       THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the start of Tape
             We are back on the record at 2:39 p.m.
10
11
              Q. (BY MS. HILL) I just have a few more questions
12
         for you.
13
              Α.
                  Okay.
14
                  When you first became involved in this project,
15
         what were you told about the lawsuit?
                       MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
16
17
              A. Almost nothing.
18
              Q. (BY MS. HILL) Do you know whether the lawsuit had
19
         been filed?
20
              A.
                  I have no idea.
21
              Q. Have you done any independent research about the
         lawsuit since your involvement --
22
23
                  No.
              Α.
24
              Q. -- in this project?
              A. No. Sorry.
25
```

1 Q. Do you read the Tulsa World? 2 Yes. Α. Did you read the articles about this lawsuit in 3 the Tulsa World? 4 5 A. Usually not, no. Q. Me, neither. 6 A. We only get the paper on Thursday, Friday --7 8 Thursday, Friday, Saturday and Sunday. So what comes 9 before that, I don't get the Tulsa World, but usually not. O. Okay. From your work on this project, do you have 10 11 any independent recollection of any farm operations that were associated with Cargill? 12 13 A. No. 14 Q. Do you have any knowledge or recollection of any 15 person associated with Cargill in any way from your work on this project? 16 17 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. 18 Α. No. 19 MS. HILL: I'm gonna pass the witness. 20 EXAMINATION 21 BY MS. LLOYD: Q. You mentioned that you had seen some aerial photos 22 23 with what you described as burn circles, spots on them. 24 Α. Yes. 25 Q. Did you see poultry litter being applied to those

60

1	areas?
2	A. Personally, no.
3	Q. Did you investigate whether did you investigate
4	how much, if any, poultry litter had been applied on those
5	areas?
6	A. No.
7	Q. Did you investigate whether commercial fertilizer
8	had been applied on those areas?
9	A. No.
LO	Q. Do you have any recollection of farm operations
11	associated with George's, Inc. from your observations?
12	A. No.
L3	Q. Is it fair to say you're unable to testify that
L4	you witnessed any unlawful activity by George's, Inc.?
L5	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
L6	A. It's fair to say that if there was illegal
L7	activity, that I didn't know whatever laws as far as
18	poultry and litter go, that I knew that it was illegal.
L9	There could have been illegal activity that I did not
20	recognize, but it's fair to say that I didn't know it was
21	illegal if it was occurring.
22	Q. (BY MS. LLOYD) Did you witness any activity by
23	George's, Inc. or its representatives or contract growers

24

25

during your time there?

A. I'm sure I did.

1	Q. Do you have any recollection of that at this time?
2	A. No. It would be in the notes if I had if I
3	noticed any activity, legal or illegal. What I'm trying to
4	say is it could have something that I saw could have
5	been illegal, but I didn't know it was illegal. Do you see
6	what I'm saying? I'm not trying to be difficult.
7	Q. No. I see what you're saying. So you cannot
8	testify that you saw any unlawful activities on your
9	observations; is that correct?
10	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
11	A. No, I cannot testify that I saw any unlawful
12	activity because I didn't know it was unlawful if it was.
13	So I see what you're saying, but I don't know if it was
14	illegal or not.
15	Q. (BY MS. LLOYD) Did you see any activity that you
16	think might be illegal?
17	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
18	A. Possibly.
19	Q. (BY MS. LLOYD) As a police officer, do you feel
20	an obligation to report illegal activity when you see it?
21	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
22	A. Well, we we weren't there to determine
23	legality. We were just there to document.
24	Q. (BY MS. LLOYD) I know. That wasn't my question.
25	A. And also, it's the State of Arkansas, not the

1	State of Oklahoma. I have no jurisdiction as a police
2	officer there.
3	Q. I understand that. But as as a police officer,
4	do you feel an obligation to report illegal activity when
5	you see it, regardless of whether you're on duty or off
6	duty or within your jurisdiction?
7	A. Yeah. I think we did that with our notes, because
8	I assumed it would go to a higher authority based on what
9	we were doing. So I kind of felt like we did report it.
10	Now again, I don't know enough about the the laws as far
11	as that area is concerned, to know whether it was legal or
12	illegal. It could be perfectly legal to go out and spread
13	chicken manure as fertilizer. I don't know, you know,
14	because I don't know rates, you know, just spread rates and
15	all of that stuff, so I don't know if what I saw was
16	illegal or not.
17	Q. Okay. So you have no knowledge of laws regarding
18	the spreading of poultry litter?
19	A. Correct.
20	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
21	THE WITNESS: Sorry.
22	A. Correct.
23	MS. LLOYD: Okay. Thank you. No further
24	questions.
25	EXAMINATION

63

1	DV	T//T	MIRKES:
- 1	H Y	INIK	WIRKES.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

23

- Q. Hello, sir. My name is Craig Mirkes. We met earlier. I represent Peterson Farms. And I'll keep my questions pretty brief, I hope. I'm gonna go back through the testimony and kind of clean up some areas that I didn't fully understand and want to explore a little bit more.
  - Α. Okay.
- Earlier kind of in passing when -- when you were asked about any -- if you had any ag experience, you said no. But you did mention kind of in passing that your uncle had a sod farm; is that correct?
- Yes, down in Southern Oklahoma. I never worked on it or anything like that, but --
  - Where at in Southern Oklahoma? Q.
- It was south of -- it was south of Muskogee, but I don't recall the town name. You had to go through Stringtown to get there, I remember that.
  - Q. Did you ever visit the sod farm?
- 19 Yes. Α.
  - Did you visit the sod farm when the sod farm was being fertilized?
- No. 22 Α.
  - Do you know if your uncle ever used poultry litter to fertilize his sod?
- 25 A. I have no idea.

1	Q. You were asked earlier if you had any
2	environmental training with respect to your job as a police
3	officer.
4	A. Yes.
5	Q. And you only mentioned Hazmat training.
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. What does Hazmat stand for?
8	A. Hazardous materials.
9	Q. When you went out into the Watershed, you said you
10	saw that you remembered only one litter application, but
11	then we looked at a picture and and so there was at
12	least two. What did you what would you wear when you
13	went out to the Watershed generally?
14	A. Just comfortable clothes, either slacks and a
15	shirt, blue jeans and a T-shirt, whatever you would wear
16	normally every day.
17	Q. Did the State ever issue you any kind of Hazmat
18	clothing?
19	A. No.
20	Q. Did the State ever tell you that poultry litter is
21	a hazardous material?
22	A. Not to my knowledge.
23	Q. Can you explain what you mean by not to your
24	knowledge?
25	A. They didn't tell me specifically. I don't know

what they have told the others that went out there.

- Q. Is it your understanding that poultry litter is a hazardous material?
  - A. I don't know.

Q. If the State considered it a hazardous material, would you have liked for them to have told you -- tell you that if you were investigating in the Watershed?

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

- A. Again, we never came in direct contact with the chicken litter, so I would say, yes, I would like to know, but I don't think it was extremely important because we weren't physically dealing with it, you know, like with our hands and stuff.
- Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) Sure. Yesterday in -- when we were talking to Mr. Steele, I kind of went through this same line of questioning and I think it's pretty obvious he spent a lot more time in the Watershed than you did.
  - A. Yes.
- Q. One of the instances he recollected of watching spreading litter, he was hit by litter being spread from a truck. Was that an incident that you were with him or -- or do you recall that?
- A. No. I think I would remember that and I don't recall that.
  - Q. What was the closest you ever came to spreading

activity, as far as distance? 1 2 A. In some of the photos that we have seen here today, it was about as close -- maybe following a truck 3 from Point A to Point B, but never hands on, so --4 5 Q. And just to be clear, are you represented by counsel today? 6 7 A. Yes. 8 Q. He is your attorney? 9 A. No, he is not my -- I'm sorry. I am not represented by counsel. I believe the State has someone 10 11 here to be with me to object to the questions, but I do not 12 have a personal attorney. 13 Q. He's objecting on behalf of the State, not on behalf of you? 14 15 MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form. Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) That question is to you. 16 17 I'm gonna say yes, he is. Α. 18 Were you instructed when -- whenever you met with 19 Mr. Garren, did he say anything about an attorney being 20 here today? Yes. 21 Α. For the State? 22 Q. I don't recall how he put it. He just said they 23 would -- an attorney would be here. 24

Q. In your opinion, what is the difference between

25

litter spreading and litter dumping? Because you've used both terms in this deposition today.

- A. Again, this is my personal --
- Q. That's all I'm asking for.
- A. -- opinion only. Dumping would be taking a truck load, like a dump truck and dumping the entire pile into one area or one place. Spreading is the same dump truck, but you are literally throwing the litter out from the truck and spreading it over a -- a bigger area than just dumping it and leaving it. Does that make any sense?
- Q. It makes complete sense. And I think I would describe it, I guess, in the same way semantically. The -- so in the pictures we were just looking at in the last exhibit, that was litter spreading; is that correct? I mean, that was a litter spreader --
  - A. Yes, in the --
  - Q. -- that's not litter dumping?
- A. In the last series of pictures, yes, that was a litter spreader.
- Q. And that was Exhibit 3, so where it says litter dumping on the form, I mean, that was just really mislabeled or your opinion changed or the way you've used these terms changed between then and now; is that accurate?
  - MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
- A. Again, I'm gonna -- not to be difficult, but I'm

going back to what I said earlier. There's no way for me to know that the pictures that I took with those notations are these pictures because they're not labeled in any way. So I'm not trying to evade your question. I'm just saying that based on my -- what we just discussed about dumping and spreading, yes, spreading is when it comes out of the back of a truck in a large area. So I don't know.

- Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) I'll represent to you that your observation about the pictures being difficult to match up to the sheets is our same observation. And it -- I know the paralegals in my office went to great pains to put those pictures together and that's the way the State produced them to us. So to the extent that those pictures are incorrect, the only thing we can do is present them to the people that took the photographs, which is the investigators, and have them identify them with respect to the investigative report. Because you're the only person -- you and whoever you're with are the only persons in the universe that can really match those up.
  - A. Yeah. I'm not accusing you of giving me --
  - Q. Oh, yeah.
- A. -- bad, you know, pictures with different information or anything. I'm just saying without -- at the time I took the pictures, I could directly match them to the form that I put them on. Now, that is more difficult

```
1
         for me to do because literally I'm sure thousands of
 2
         pictures were taken, not necessarily by me, but by
         everybody combined, so --
3
                  I'm gonna had you what will be marked as --
 4
5
                       THE REPORTER: 5, I think.
6
                       MS. HILL: Yeah, 5.
7
                       (Exhibit No. 5 was marked.)
8
              Α.
                  Okay.
9
                  (BY MR. MIRKES) I will apologize to Counsel that
         their copies do not have color photographs attached, only
10
11
         the witness does.
                       And -- and -- and you'll see in the bottom
12
13
         right-hand corner above the Bates number, we have a frame
         number marked. See like, for instance, on Page 2, do you
14
15
         see down on Page 2 where it says Frame 908?
                  Yes.
16
              Α.
              Q. And to the --
17
18
              Α.
                  Okay. I see.
19
              Q. And so in -- in order to try and help this process
20
         along, and like I said earlier, we -- we can't be 100
21
         percent sure that's accurate. And since you were a party
         to it, if you see something you think is inaccurate, I'd
22
         like you to go ahead and point that out to me.
23
                  Okay.
24
              Α.
25
                  Thank you, sir. Have you had a chance to look
```

70

1 through that?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And this appears to be an investigation report done on 6/16/2005; is that correct?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Were you a party as an observer to this investigation?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. And this is -- it has written down here the individual's name is McReynolds Farm integrator named Peterson Farms; is that correct?
  - A. Yes.
    - Q. Okay. If you'll look at Frame 912.
- A. Yes.
- Q. And -- and if I match that back up to your description, it says -- well, why don't you -- why don't you read what 912 says.
- A. Sure. I believe, if I remember correctly, it's saying that we're taking the picture maybe north to south and it's also associated with Frame 741 and 742 and that there's an active fan with litter on the ground.
- Q. Okay. So 741 and 742, because I see -- if you'll look up at 908 just above that, I see those same numbers and I'm just trying to understand. And I also see it in association with 913. Well, and if I'd look over to the

Electronically signed by Lisa Smith (601-374-084-6632)

right, do you see where it says photographs, that box says photographs and it says WP 741, could that be waypoints?

- A. Yes, it could be.
- Q. Were those waypoints predetermined by somebody else?
- A. You'll have to give me a second to try and remember, because --
  - Q. Take all the time you need.
- A. -- we -- we had waypoints that had been given to us. And there were some, for example, if we came up on a farm that was not documented in the waypoints that we were given to go look at, then we would put in our own waypoint based on a handheld GPS that we had. So I'm going to say that these were given to us by someone else to go to that location.
- Q. Okay. And not to break our train of thought, but you brought something up I want to ask about --
  - A. Okay.
- Q. -- since you did bring it up. You said if you would come across a -- a farm that wasn't an assigned waypoint, you would stop and do an investigation. Did I hear you correctly?
- A. Well, we weren't investigating anything. We were just documenting what was there. But again, to my recollection, I -- I -- I'm really trying to remember. We

Electronically signed by Lisa Smith (601-374-084-6632)

72

had books that had waypoints in them. Like, for example, Waypoint No. 84 was this waypoint. But I'm -- I'm 99 percent sure that that waypoint was given to us and that's why we ended up at this location. Most of the stuff that I remembered that -- and there weren't many, that we came across were old, abandoned, almost fallen down, torn down, hadn't been used for quite some time type stuff. And we documented them, try just to make sure that we tried to document everything that we could. Fair enough. Ο. That's the best of my recollection. Α. Thank you. Q. Α. You bet. Q. Let's go back to -- to Frame 912. Okay. Α. You reference here -- is this your handwriting? Q. Yes, it is. Α. Q. You reference litter on the ground? Yes. Α. Q. Can you identify that litter for me on Frame 912? Sure. Especially in the -- and again, I'm gonna say this -- the first building, which is the building in the back of the picture. Just so we're looking at the same

Q. The buildings are numbered 1 and 2. Do you see

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

building.

73

1	that?
2	A. Yeah, it's Building No. 2 that I'm looking at.
3	And the dark substance coming out of the door appears to be
4	chicken litter, like tracked-out chicken litter from the
5	door.
6	Q. I hate to do this. Can I borrow your copy because
7	yours is in color?
8	A. Sure. Go ahead.
9	Q. Okay. I see what you're referencing now.
10	A. Okay.
11	Q. Did you take a sample of that suspected litter
12	which you assumed was litter?
13	A. No. We didn't go on anybody's property.
14	Q. So you don't really know if that was litter?
15	A. No.
16	Q. Let's look now at Frame 913 and can you read the
17	description for 913?

- A. Yeah. It looks like a service drive, which I'm assuming is back to the building that also goes with 741 and 412, which I'm assuming are probably on a different sheet of paper, maybe. Trailer, dump truck, spreader, uncovered chicken litter, edge of yard.
  - Q. Okay. Can you tell me what W/S means?
  - A. I probably could when I wrote it.
- Q. All right. But as you sit here today, you have no

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

74

1 idea what that means? 2 I don't recall, no. Α. Q. Okay. You note there uncovered chicken litter 3 edge of yard. Can you identify that for me? 4 5 A. Yes. There's a -- what appears to be a pile back in the right between the building and the tree on the right 6 7 edge frame. That looks like a pile of dirt? 8 Q. 9 Or a pile of litter, yeah. I'm -- yes. Α. Yes, it does look like a pile of dirt? 10 Ο. Or a pile of litter, yes. 11 Α. How could one distinguish from this vantage point 12 Ο. 13 whether that was dirt or litter? 14 A. Usually we -- we could tell by smell. Chicken 15 litter has a pretty distinct smell, as I'm sure you know. And again, we didn't go on property and take samples 16

Q. So you could smell that pile is what you're telling me?

so we didn't intrude on anybody.

A. I don't recall -- I can't tell you sitting right here that, yes, I did smell that. I'm just kind of trying to go based off the notes and I'm just kind of assuming that's what we did.

because we were told to stay off the property of everybody,

Q. Did you have to make a lot of assumptions when you

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

75

saw a pile that it was chicken litter?

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

A. No. It was usually -- once you do it two or three times, you get a pretty good idea of what chicken litter looks like and smells like. Again, no expert, this is

Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) And I completely understand and appreciate that.

 $$\operatorname{MR.}$  MIRKES: I believe that's all the questions I have.

- Q. With respect to seeing a pile of litter on any of the various defendants' property, pile of litter, pile of anything --
  - A. Uh-huh.

laymen's opinion only.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q.  $\operatorname{\mathsf{--}}$  did you have to make an assumption as to what that was a pile of?

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

A. I'm gonna say no. Some were very evidently -most were very evidently chicken litter, just based on -usually if it's in a chicken litter shack, which is a lot
of stuff that we did, it's chicken litter. Or if there's
chicken litter or stuff coming out of the barn, it's not
dirt, it's chicken litter. You can smell it. You can see
it. But again, that's just my layman's opinion based on
the things that I saw when I was over there.

76

Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) What we see in Photo 913 and that -- in looking through the documents, there's various photos that are similar to this.

A. Uh-huh.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q. -- this appears not to be in any kind of a shack. It appears to be -- I can't tell distance in this photo, but a fair distance from where your vantage point is. And you just said you had to assume that that was chicken litter. And -- so my question to you is, did you make those kind -- same kind of assumptions in the same scenario for all the defendants' farms that you visited?

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

- A. You would have to be specific with that because I don't know. You would have to show me pictures and stuff.
- Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) We're on Exhibit 6. I'm gonna hand you what's been marked as Exhibit 6.

(Exhibit No. 6 was marked.)

- Q. Does this appear to be a report that you wrote --
- 19 A. Yes.
  - Q. -- Mr. Walton? And this report is dated 6/16/2005; is that correct?
    - A. Yes.
  - Q. And this is -- the grower you were investigating at this time was Bloomfield Farm and that is a Peterson grower. It's not -- it's not noted on the form, but I will

represent to you that it is. Earlier we had some discussion about the check boxes for stack used litter/cake and stacked new litter. Do you remember that discussion?

A. Yes.

- Q. And I see in -- on this form that both of those boxes are checked. And based upon your earlier description of what those two boxes meant, I guess I would ask for you to describe for me where the new litter was as opposed to the used litter and why you checked both of those boxes.
- A. The only thing I can think of, and again, not recalling the incident specifically but looking at the notes, was that I was with Rod Hummel on this occasion.

  And they were out there almost every day. So he could tell -- we had conversations about what was, you know, if that was new litter, if he saw it yesterday or the day before when he was out there with somebody else or if it was used litter that, you know, maybe we had both seen last week or whatever. So that's why -- that's the only thing I can assume both of those boxes are checked, without speaking to him specifically in reference to that. I don't know.
- Q. I asked Mr. Hummel specifically if someone answered a question that he was driving based upon the form, that he would have no reason to disagree with an answer that was given by that person and in this case that

78

1	person was you.
2	A. Okay.
3	Q. So that both you know, both observers would
4	have the same observation that is listed on the form. If
5	Mr. Hummel were out there the day before, like you said, as
6	a possibility, would there be a form created for that, an
7	investigation form?
8	A. Not that I'm aware of. There could have been, but
9	I've never filled one out.
10	Q. Okay. So I understand, was there anytime you were
11	in the Watershed doing this investigation that you did not
12	fill out a form?
13	A. No.
14	Q. Was it protocol if if you were out in the
15	Watershed observing or investigating that you filled out a
16	form?

- A. Yes.
- Q. Did you ever -- did you ever observe what I will call bedding material, which would be new bedding material outside of a poultry house prior to them putting it in and then adding poultry?

MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.

- Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) Was I unclear?
- A. I'm not sure. You're gonna have to be little more descriptive in bedding material.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1	Q. What is litter, in your own
2	A. Chicken waste.
3	Q. In your observation, is it only the chicken
4	excrement or do they add a bedding layer prior to putting
5	chickens in there?
6	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
7	A. And I don't know.
8	Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) So so far as you know, litter
9	is 100 percent excrement?
10	A. I really
11	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
12	A. I don't know.
13	Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) Do you know what shavings are?
14	Did you ever hear of that term?
15	A. No.
16	Q. Rice hulls?
17	A. No.
18	Q. Let's look at Photo 814, if you will, Frame 814.
19	A. Okay.
20	Q. What does that depict?
21	A. Uncovered chicken litter.
22	Q. How do you know?
23	A. Again, I'm gonna have to go back to look and
24	smell, because we were obviously reasonably close to this.
25	But again, I don't specifically recall taking the picture.

1	Q. Were you on a public roadway when you took this
2	photo?
3	A. Yes. On a public roadway or county road or public
4	access. We never entered property.
5	Q. So you, again, assume that that's chicken litter.
6	You didn't take any samples or
7	A. Correct. We did not
8	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
9	A. We did not take a sample.
10	Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) Look at Photo 815, if you will.
11	And the description of this, I read it to say unknown
12	liquid tank. Is that a fair reading of that?
13	A. Yes, that was a fair reading.
14	Q. What why did you take a photo and note an
15	unknown liquid tank?
16	A. I think we tried to document everything that was
17	just in that area around the chicken houses, whether I
18	personally knew what it was or not. That's why I didn't
19	try and guess. I just said it was unknown, what appeared
20	to be a liquid tank.
21	Q. So it was it was more and I'm really asking
22	for my own curiosity, this was more of a maybe an
23	indication that that this was an active poultry house,
24	because there's a liquid tank or
25	A. I think it was

1	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
2	A. I think it was just me trying to document
3	everything that was right around the houses.
4	Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) Okay. Anything else in these
5	photographs that appear to be improper or unlawful?
6	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
7	A. Other than my focus skills, no, there isn't.
8	Q. (BY MR. MIRKES) I may have already asked this.
9	Did you you visited in your time in the Watershed,
LO	several Peterson contract grower farms; is that correct?
11	A. I would think so, yes.
12	Q. As you sit here today, do you have any
L3	recollection of visiting those farms?
L4	A. No.
L5	Q. Do you ever remember seeing a Peterson sign while
L6	in the Watershed?
L7	A. I can't specifically point you to a specific
18	location, but yes, we saw several signs.
L9	Q. Did you see any unlawful activity at any of those
20	contract grower farms?
21	MR. ISKANIAN: Object to form.
22	A. Again, not knowing what is unlawful in that area,
23	I don't know.
24	MR. MIRKES: I'm gonna pass the witness.
25	MS. HILL: I thought I was done. I have one

82

1 more question. 2 FURTHER EXAMINATION BY MS. HILL: 3 Today you've been asked questions about Cargill 4 5 contract growers, persons associated with Cargill, persons associated with George's and persons associated with 6 7 Peterson. Sitting here today, do you have any independent 8 recollection of making observations of growers or other 9 persons associated with any of the other defendants in this litigation? 10 11 A. No. MS. HILL: Thank you. I have no further 12 13 questions. 14 MR. ISKANIAN: I just have a couple of short 15 ones. 16 EXAMINATION BY MR. ISKANIAN: 17 18 Q. I believe you just testified to when Peterson's 19 attorney was questioning you that you -- after I objected, 20 you said that you had not observed. The question, I 21 believe, was did you observe anything unlawful. Do you observe anything unlawful in these pictures and I believe 22 23 you said no. Would it be fair to say that you did not 24 observe anything lawful? 25 MR. MIRKES: Object to form.

1 MS. HILL: Object to form. 2 Again, I'm gonna go back to the not knowing the 3 laws of the poultry industry or government, you know, that effects that -- I -- I don't know. 4 5 Q. (BY MR. ISKANIAN) Okay. 6 A. We just documented what we saw and we turned it 7 over. And also throughout the day today, we've used the 8 9 words dispose, spread, dump, hazardous, litter, bedding material, et cetera. Do you note that the context in which 10 we've used these words comply with their lawful definition? 11 MR. MIRKES: Object to form. 12 13 MS. HILL: Object to form. 14 Α. I don't know. 15 Q. (BY MR. ISKANIAN) So is it fair to say -- is it possible that the way you have used these or even that 16 17 counsel have used these words may not comply with how 18 they're actually defined in law? 19 MR. MIRKES: Object to form. 20 MS. HILL: Object to form. 21 Yes. Α. MR. ISKANIAN: No further questions. 22 23 MR. MIRKES: I've got some follow-ups based on that. 24 25 FURTHER EXAMINATION

Electronically signed by Lisa Smith (601-374-084-6632)

1 BY MR. MIRKES: 2 Q. Based upon the questions you were just asked regarding some of the words he just mentioned, does that 3 change any of your answers today, the -- the words we used? 4 5 A. No. MR. MIRKES: That's all I have. 6 7 MS. HILL: I advise you that you have the right to read and sign and review your testimony here today 8 9 or you may waive that. THE WITNESS: Okay. 10 11 MS. HILL: What would you like to do? 12 THE WITNESS: I'll waive it. 13 MS. HILL: Okay. Thanks so much. THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're off the record at 14 15 3:12 p.m. (End of proceedings at 3:12 p.m.) 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

85

STATE OF OKLAHOMA)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I, Lisa Smith, a Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of Oklahoma, do hereby certify that, pursuant to the agreement hereinbefore set forth, there came before me on the 8th day of April, A.D., 2009, at 1:24 p.m., in the offices of Rhodes, Hieronymus, Jones, Tucker & Gable, PLLC, located at 100 West Fifth Street, Suite 400, in the City of Tulsa, State of Oklahoma, the following named person, to wit: JACK WALTON, who was by me duly cautioned and sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, of his knowledge touching and concerning the matters in controversy in this cause; and that he was thereupon carefully examined upon his oath, and his examination was reduced to writing under my supervision; that the deposition is a true record of the testimony given by the witness; signature of the witness being waived pursuant to agreement of the parties; and that the amount of time used by each party at the deposition is as follows:

Ms. Hill - 01 hours, 12 minutes,

Ms. Lloyd - 00 hours, 04 minutes,

Mr. Mirkes - 00 hours, 27 minutes,

Mr. Iskanian - 00 hours, 01 minutes.

I further certify that I am neither attorney or counsel for, nor related to or employed by, any of the parties to the action in which this deposition is taken,

1	and further that I am not a relative or employee of any
2	attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, or
3	financially interested in the action.
4	I further certify that, before completion of the
5	deposition, the Deponent, and/or the
6	Plaintiff/Defendant, did did not request
7	to review the transcript.
8	In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my hand and
9	affixed my speller his 20th day of April, A.D., 2009.
10	Lisa Omith
11	LISA SMITH, OK CSR 01778
	Expiration Date: 12/31/2009
12	Esquire Deposition Solutions
	Firm Registration No. 286
13	1700 Pacific Avenue, Suite 4750
	Dallas, Texas 75201
14	(214) 257-1436
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	